Making the Case for Holistic Admissions: Perspectives from Dentistry, Medicine, and Nursing

Mark A. López, Ph.D.
Interim Senior Vice President
Access, Diversity and Inclusion
American Dental Education Association
Holistic Admissions in the Health Professions
FINDINGS FROM A NATIONAL SURVEY

Source: http://www uuhealth.org
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

- Urban Universities for HEALTH and the survey data are part of the National Study on University Admissions in the Health Professions.

- A partnership of the Association of Public and Land-Grant Universities (APLU)/Coalition of Urban Serving Universities (USU) and the Association of American Medical Colleges (AAMC), with funding from the National Institutes of Health (NIH) National Institute on Minority Health and Health Disparities (NIMHD) and the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA).
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

• First to examine the nationwide impact and use of holistic review for students pursuing careers in the health professions.

• Describe the impact on academic success, diversity, and other outcomes such as students’ engagement with the community.
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

- The AAMC convened its Holistic Review Committee in 2007 and piloted its first Holistic Review in Admissions workshop with 10 member institutions in 2010. Similar workshops have been conducted in dentistry since 2009 by the American Dental Education Association (ADEA).

- The project aimed to improve evidence and the use of data that will help universities enhance and expand a diverse and prepared health workforce with the goal of improving health and health equity in underserved urban communities.
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

• This study was recommended as a way to better understand and evaluate the growing practice of holistic review and its role in diversifying the health professions. Additional research related to this national study are ongoing, including an in depth examination of admissions practices in nursing that may contribute to increased student body diversity.
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

• SURVEY PURPOSE: to determine the extent to which health professions schools at public universities in the United States have adopted holistic review.

• SURVEY DESIGN: The researchers developed a survey instrument designed to assess admissions practices and student outcomes based on existing admissions literature.
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

• SAMPLING METHODS: An electronic survey was sent to presidents of 163 public universities having two or more health professions schools, with instructions to forward the survey to deans and admissions directors at each school of medicine, dentistry, pharmacy, nursing, and public health at the institution.

• A total of 104 universities in 45 states participated in the study, for a response rate of 64 percent. Two hundred and twenty-eight (228) individual health professions schools completed the survey, including 66 nursing schools, 44 medical schools, 43 dental schools, 39 schools or programs of public health, and 36 pharmacy schools.
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

• Results: Sixty-seven percent of health professions schools responding to the survey reported having changed to a holistic admission process within the past 10 years, and 8 percent indicated that they had used a holistic admission process for more than 10 years.

• Use of holistic review varies by field, with more frequent use reported among the surveyed medical and dental schools and less frequent use among the nursing schools surveyed.
WHAT IS THE EVIDENCE: BENEFITS OF HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

• 38 percent of the schools self-identified as using holistic review in the past decade are using “many elements” of a holistic admission process, 48 percent have adopted “some elements,” and the remaining 14 percent are using few or no practices consistent with holistic admission.
The Importance of Diversity in Academic Dentistry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Importance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increases access to high-quality oral health care services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broadens the research agenda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advances cultural competence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supports institutional excellence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhances education along the continuum</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Access, Diversity, and Inclusion Portfolio

- Fellowships, internships and awards programs for faculty of color and women.
- Recruitment activities with feeder colleges/universities pre-health advisors.
- Professional Development conferences for diverse leaders.
- National partnerships with philanthropy and other associations.
Access, Diversity, and Inclusion Portfolio

- Admissions and Diversity Workshops.
- Liaison to the Council of Students Residents and Fellows and Student Diversity Leadership Program.
- Facilitating exposure and entry via pipeline programs (Summer Health Professions Education Program).
Opportunities

Vision and support of leadership for diversity as a driver for excellence

A working pipeline

Institutional climate for diversity is critical—it’s more than numbers.

Holistic review

Collaborations create opportunities for sustainability
WHY DOES A DIVERSE DENTAL WORKFORCE MATTER?

• The U.S. medical and oral health workforce has failed to keep pace with the growing racial and ethnic diversity of the nation.

• Workforce is inadequately diverse to address health disparities.

• Improves the cultural competency of patient care.
WHY DOES A DIVERSE DENTAL WORKFORCE MATTER?

Students in diverse and inclusive environments:

• Think more critically and deeply.

• Are better at solving complex problems.

• Are motivated to participate in a diverse democracy.
Diversity & Holistic Admissions Practices: CORE Principles

Focus on holistic admissions practices:

• Mission-driven.

• Balance consideration of experiences, attributes, and metrics.

• Grounded in evidence.

• Considers how each applicant will contribute to teaching, learning and practice.
BACKGROUND

• The ADEA Holistic Review Workshops (AHRW) began in 2004 as the ADEA Admissions Committee Workshops (ADEA ACW).

• To implement the ADEA ACW program, David Brunson, D.D.S., Associate Director for the Center for Equity and Diversity at ADEA, received support from the Pipeline, Profession, and Practice: Community Based Dental Education program Round II, which was funded by the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation.

• From 2004 to 2009, ADEA ACWs were presented by Dr. Brunson, During this time, 16 workshops were held at 16 dental schools.
BACKGROUND

• In 2009, ADEA received additional support from the Profession, and Practice: Community Based Dental Education program for dental school admissions officers to participate in a Train-the-Trainers Admissions Committee Workshop.

• After this training, teams co-present the in pairs at additional dental schools. This is the current model for ARHWs.

• There were 6 initial workshops under this Train-the-Trainers model in the summer of 2009.

• We have just completed our annual training for the 9th time.
OUR NUMBERS

• ADEA has averaged 3.5 workshops per year. This includes a bit of variance from year to year.

• Between 2004 and present day, 49 workshops have been held at 40 schools within 38 institutions. Not all presentations have been to dental schools.

• University of Florida College of Dentistry has hosted two workshops and its School of Veterinary Medicine has hosted one workshop.

• The year 2009 had the most workshops conducted with a total of 10.
THE CONTENT AND ASSESSMENT

• The core message of the workshops has largely stayed the same over the years.
• They are meant to be informative, flexible, and non-prescriptive.
• The main components of a workshop are:
  - Tying admissions work to mission and mission statement.
  - The legal groundwork and potential implications.
  - Considering experiences, attributes, and academic metrics (EAM).
  - The composition and structure of admissions committees
  - Case studies of holistic review.
• Participants complete post-workshop surveys to aid in training of presenters and assess whether the content is meeting current needs.